

GIBSON LAW FIRM, PLLC  
Sujata S. Gibson, Esq.  
832 Hanshaw Rd.  
Ithaca, NY 14850

NELSON MADDEN BLACK LLP  
Jonathan R. Nelson, Esq.  
475 Park Ave. S., Suite 2800  
New York, NY 10016

---

June 13, 2022

**By ECF**

Hon. Edgardo Ramos  
United States District Court  
Southern District of New York  
Thurgood Marshall Courthouse  
40 Foley Square  
New York, NY 10007

Re: *Keil, et al., v. The City of New York, et al., No. 21 Civ. 8773*  
*Kane, et al., v. Bill de Blasio, et al., No. 21 Civ. 7863*

Dear Judge Ramos:

Counsel for the *Kane* and *Keil* Plaintiffs in this matter jointly submit this letter motion in response to this Court's order dated June 13, 2022, reassigning the case from Hon. Valerie E. Caproni to Your Honor.

As you may know, Judge Caproni recused herself because of investments in Pfizer, which constitute a financial conflict in this case because it could create the perception of partiality in violation of 28 U.S.C. §455(a) and (b)(4). [*See*, ECF 175].

We note respectfully that, according to the most recent financial disclosures available at <https://www.courtlistener.com/person/2655/disclosure/33780/edgardo-ramos/> [PDF of 2020 attached and incorporated as Exhibit A], Your Honor also has stock in Pfizer and multiple other pharmaceutical companies whose stock could be impacted by the holding in this case. Specifically, the most recent financial disclosure shows holdings in Covid vaccine manufacturers Pfizer and AstraZeneca, as well as Takeda pharmaceutical and Thermo Fisher Scientific (both recently partnered with Moderna to produce Spikevax) and other companies that produce or are impacted by vaccine mandates, including but not limited to Merck, Sanofi, and GSK. Ownership of these stocks, singly and collectively, leads to a reasonable question regarding impartiality, particularly given the history of this case and the reason for reassignment of the case. For the same reasons that plaintiffs jointly moved the Court to disqualify Judge Caproni [ECF 171-174 incorporated by reference herein], Plaintiffs respectfully ask that Your Honor recuse himself from this case and direct the Clerk to assign another Judge without any financial conflict of interest as soon as possible given the urgent injunctive relief pending before the Court.

Respectfully submitted,

*/s/ Jonathan R. Nelson*  
Counsel for Keil Plaintiffs

*/s/ Sujata S. Gibson*  
Counsel for Kane Plaintiffs

cc: All counsel via ECF